

**GOOD GOVERNANCE
STANDARDS
IN THE UNITS OF
LOCAL
SELF-GOVERNMENT**

PROJECT
„MONITORING PRINCIPLES
OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION
IN PRESERVING GOOD
GOVERNANCE VALUES“



This project is funded
by the European Union



ЦЕНТАР ЗА
УПРАВУВАЊЕ СО
ПРОМЕНИ



Management Consulting Association





GOOD GOVERNANCE STANDARDS IN THE UNITS OF LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT



PROJECT „MONITORING PRINCIPLES
OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN PRESERVING
GOOD GOVERNANCE VALUES“



This project is funded by
the European Union



ЦЕНТАР ЗА
УПРАВУВАЊЕ СО
ПРОМЕНИ



SCOOP
CIJ-MACEDONIA

Publisher: Center for Change Management, Management Consulting Association MKA-2000, Center for Investigative Journalism SCOOP

For the publisher: Neda Maleska Sachmaroska, Center for Change Management

Adaptation of the SIGMA principles done by: Martin Todevski, Neda Maleska-Sachmaroska, Mirjana Apostolova, Viktorija Sazdova

Associate: Eli Cakar, State Councilor, Ministry of Local Self-Government

Translation & proofreading: Vision Academy

Design and print: Polyesterday

Number of copies: 100 (free of charge/non-commercial copies)

The structure of this document is based on the "Principles of Public Administration"¹ produced by SIGMA², defining the benchmarks for good governance in the candidate-countries for accession to the European Union within the process for European integration.

CIP - Каталогизација во публикација
Национална и универзитетска библиотека "Св. Климент Охридски", Скопје

352:005(497.7)

GOOD governance standards in the units of local self-government / [Martin Todevski ... идр.]. - Скопје : Center for change management, 2017. - 68 стр. : илустр. ; 25 см

Фусноти кон текстот. - Публикацијата е во рамките на проектот: "Monitoring principles of public administration in preserving good governance values". - Автори: Martin Todevski, Neda Maleska-Sachmaroska, Mirjana Apostolova, Viktorija Sazdova. - Содржи и: Methodological annex

ISBN 978-608-4818-31-1

1. Todevski, Martin [автор]

а) Локална самоуправа - Управување - Македонија

COBISS.MK-ID 105528330



This publication has been produced with the assistance of the European Union. The contents of the publication are the responsibility of the Center for Change Management and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union.

1 http://www.sigmaweb.org/publications/Principles-of-Public-Administration_Edition-2017_ENG.pdf

2 SIGMA (Support for Improvement in Governance and Management) is a joint initiative of the OECD and the European Union, with a goal of strengthening good governance in the public sector.

CONTENT

INTRODUCTION.....	7
DEVELOPMENT AND COORDINATION OF THE POLICIES AND STRATEGIES.....	11
PRINCIPLE 1:	11
The municipality has developed and adopted strategies and plans which serve as a basis for further development	11
PRINCIPLE 2:	13
The municipality has established a monitoring system for the strategies and development plans	13
PRINCIPLE 3:	14
The decisions of the municipal council are adopted in a coherent manner	14
PRINCIPLE 4:	15
The policies and the strategies are drafted in an inclusive manner, ensuring active participation of the citizens and other stakeholders	15
PRINCIPLE 5:	16
In the municipal administration there is adequate capacity for the preparation of strategic and planning documents and decisions, as well as for their implementation.	16
PUBLIC SERVICE AND MANAGEMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES.....	19
PRINCIPLE 1:	20
Employment in the municipality, in the public enterprises and institutions established by the municipality is conducted based on transparent criteria, respecting the merit-based and equal treatment principles for all.....	20
PRINCIPLE 2:	21
The employee payment system is fair and transparent	21
PRINCIPLE 3:	22
There exists a system of professional development, fair assessment, mobility and promotion based on objective and transparent criteria.....	22
PRINCIPLE 4:	23
Measures have been introduced for promoting integrity and prevention of corruption and conflict of interests.....	23

TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY.....	25
PRINCIPLE 1:	25
The local municipality organization ensures accountability.....	25
PRINCIPLE 2:	26
The right to free access to public information is consistently applied at a local level.....	26
PRINCIPLE 3:	27
The municipality shall proactively publish public information on its web site	27
PRINCIPLE 4:	28
Functional mechanisms for internal audit shall be introduced and the recommendations of the State Audit Office and the Ombudsman for protection of public interest shall be implemented.....	28
SERVICE PROVISION.....	31
PRINCIPLE 1:	32
Citizen-oriented service delivery policy shall be applied.	32
PRINCIPLE 2:	33
Mechanisms for ensuring local public service quality shall be established.....	33
PRINCIPLE 3:	34
Public services provided by the municipality are accessible to various categories of citizens.....	34
MANAGEMENT OF MUNICIPAL FINANCES.....	37
PRINCIPLE 1:	38
Budget planning and drafting is conducted in line with the defined budgetary process according to the relevant legal framework, involving the citizens, as well.....	38
PRINCIPLE 2:	39
Budget execution is transparent and followed by appropriate audit.....	39
PRINCIPLE 3:	40
Municipal public procurements shall follow the principle of transparency, nondiscrimination and equal treatment.....	40
PRINCIPLE 4:	41
The municipality and municipal public enterprises and institutions shall have sufficient capacity and resources for good management of finances.....	41
METHODOLOGICAL ANNEX OF THE STANDARDS FOR GOOD GOVERNANCE IN THE UNITS OF LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT	42
1. Development and coordination of policies and strategies.....	43
2. Public service and human resources management.....	49
3. Transparency and accountability	55
4. Service provision.....	60
5. Management of municipal finances.....	63

Acronyms

AULSG (ZELS)	Association of the Units of Local Self-Government
CAF	Common Assessment Framework
DTPS	Detailed Town Planning Scheme
EPPS	Electronic Public Procurement System
GTPS	General Town Planning Scheme
KOMSPI	Commission for Protecting the Right to Free Access to Public Information
LAS	Law on Administrative Servants
LPSE	Law on Public Sector Employees
MF	Ministry of Finance
MISA	Ministry of Information Society and Administration
PE	Public Enterprise
PP	Public Procurements
SAO	State Audit Office
SC	Steering Committee
ULSG	Units of local self-government
W3C	World Wide Web Consortium
WCAG	Web Content Accessibility Guidelines

A decorative horizontal line composed of small white dashes, starting from the left edge of the page and ending with a small white arrowhead pointing to the right, just before the start of the word 'INTRODUCTION'.

INTRODUCTION

INTRODUCTION

Our country has had an administrative tradition and culture stretching over several decades, meanwhile adapting to the democratic changes in the society led by the principles of rule of law, transparency, equal treatment, efficiency and ethics. It becomes very much apparent in the process of decentralization when the municipalities and the city of Skopje have successfully taken over and implemented the competences delegated from the central authorities.

The employees in the public sector at local level are a part of the state public administration, which implies that they fall under the same normative general frame established by the Law on the Public Sector Employees, as well as the Law on Administrative Servants. In a wider sense, it has also been prescribed in the Law on Labor Relations, referring to the employees who do not have a status of administrative servants, however since they have been working in the public sector, they are obliged to abide by the standards and principles referring to all the employees in the public service.

Therefore, the local administration has been sharing the same objectives and principles referring to all the state administrative servants, thus ensuring the implementation of unified standards not only at national, but also at European level. This approach ensures functional predictability and comparability of both the public administration and the local administration as its part, which is of paramount importance for the development and the integration process of the country.

Establishing competent, effective, efficient, responsible, service-oriented and transparent local administration, in line with the principles of the “European administrative space”, is the ultimate goal which has been determined in the 2015-2020 Program for sustainable local development and decentralization, deriving from the national strategic priorities for public administration reform.

The principles required in this document are fully in accordance with the European standards for good public sector governance, thus ensuring a distinction and comparability, and eventually accomplishment of the objectives such as departization, functional and modern citizen and business-oriented public service.



The principles entail a successful and committed leadership which transforms its visions into strategies and plans, thus ensuring a clear direction for the implementation of public policies at local level, as well as directions for professional, well-organized and trained public administration with a capacity to respond to the citizens' needs within the scope of the units of local self-government with transparent and accountable work in which the citizens are also involved. Provision of public services in an effective manner, in line with the competences and in a manner which is tailor-made for the citizens, as well as transparent and accountable public finances management, are the two aspects which are of paramount importance for maintaining citizens' trust when it comes to spending their money.

The principles pertain to the public sector employees at local level, in this document referring to all the employees in the municipality (administrative servants and employees in accordance with the Law on Labor Relations), the employees in the public enterprises established by the municipalities, including the institutions which the municipalities have founded (primary and secondary schools, kindergartens, local cultural institutions, elderly care centers, firefighters etc.)

Taking the system of local self-government as an initial point, this document refers to the municipality as a unit of self-government, which does not exclude the city of Skopje as a separate unit of local self-government deriving from the status of a capital city and its unique territorial organization.

By the Law on territorial organization of the local self-government, the local self-government in the country has been organized into 80 municipalities and the city of Skopje. Forty four units of local self-government, including the ten municipalities within the city of Skopje, are located in the towns, while 36 are rural municipalities.

The municipalities conduct their duties through the bodies (the mayor and the council) elected directly by the citizens with a four-year term of office. The municipalities have competence over urban (urban and rural) planning, issuing construction licenses for facilities of municipal importance stipulated by law, space and construction land planning, environment and nature protection, local economic development, utilities, culture, sports and recreation, social protection and the protection of children, primary and secondary education, healthcare, safety and rescuing of citizens and tangible goods, firefighting, and other functions prescribed by the law.

The municipalities conduct their competences through the municipal administration or by establishing local public enterprises and public institutions. They can also delegate their competences to other legal or natural entities based on a contract for performing activities of public interest, in accordance with the law.

The structure of this document is based on the "Principles of Public Administration" produced by SIGMA, defining the benchmarks for good governance in the candidate-countries for accession to the European Union within the process for European integration. These standards refer to the major key requirements and principles in 6 fields, including a monitoring methodology for measuring the countries' achievements in meeting the standards.

Good governance standards in the units of local self-government

By following the good practices of defining benchmarks and the method of measuring the achievements, this document lays down the fields, principles and the monitoring methodology of qualitative and quantitative indicators for every separate field, adapted to the work environment of the units of local self-government, whose modus operandi differs from that of the central authorities.



DEVELOPMENT
AND COORDINATION
OF THE POLICIES
AND STRATEGIES

A decorative white zigzag line is positioned at the bottom left of the page, extending horizontally and then turning downwards to point towards the start of the word 'AND' in the final line of the title.

DEVELOPMENT AND COORDINATION OF THE POLICIES AND STRATEGIES

One of the key principles of good governance, defined in the directions of the EU for development and coordination of policies is the existence of a successful and committed leadership which transforms its visions into strategies and plans, thus providing a clear direction in the implementation of public policies. These planning documents shall formulate the priorities, shall establish indicators about the results related to the level of the objectives accomplished, and shall also define the activities and competent entities/structures for their implementation.

The programs and the strategies of a certain municipality shall be planned in accordance with the capacities of the local administration, human and financial resources, and they have to be coherent and in line with the citizens' needs. So as to ensure their efficient implementation, it is necessary to have a structure in place, as well as a system providing monitoring and assessment of the policies effects. The process of policies creation requires the assessment of the costs and benefits, as well as the risks in the public and private sector. At the very beginning, there should be some evidence that a given policy is necessary and will help in the processes it has been drafted for. The consultation process has to be incorporated in the crucial policy development stages, since the consultations outcomes may have an impact on the final policy concept. Transparency and accountability in the planning and the preparation of the strategic documents and local policies are crucial for the successful implementation and achievement of the desired results.

PRINCIPLE 1:

The municipality has developed and adopted strategies and plans which serve as a basis for further development

1. There exists a coherent vision for local development which defines key priorities leading to improvement.
2. The objectives defined in the strategic documents are in line with the priorities determined in the strategic plan of the municipality.
3. Strategic/planning documents have been adopted which provide clear directions for promoting the processes and conditions in the municipalities.
4. The strategic and planning documents entail all the necessary segments, that is the policy objectives and result indicators, the activities and the costs, the responsible entities/structures, as well as the deadlines for the implementation and the instruments for monitoring and evaluation.
5. The measures defined in the strategic and planning documents are followed by financial, human and technical resources planning, necessary for their implementation.
6. The strategic documents of the municipality are gender sensitive.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Interview with the mayor/the secretary of the municipality and heads of sectors so as to identify the priorities for local development;
- ▶ Interviews with three civil society organizations at the most in charge of monitor the implementation of the municipal local development;
- ▶ Analysis of the legal framework defining which strategic and planning documents the municipality should adopt;
- ▶ Identification of the strategic and planning documents which the municipality has adopted;
- ▶ Analysis of the quality of the strategic and planning documents regarding the key segments to be included;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal budget and whether it covers the activities foreseen by the strategic and planning documents.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of the current municipal strategic and planning documents
- ▶ Strategic documents which have been adopted: strategic plan of the municipality, a strategy for local economic development, a strategy for culture development, a strategy for social protection of the citizens, a strategy for cooperation with the civil sector, a strategy for promotion of gender equality, youth strategy, a program for social protection, child and healthcare, energy efficiency program, program for environment protection, utilities program, a program for urban planning, general urban planning scheme, sports and recreation program, culture program, a program for celebrating certain events and prominent persons with monuments, local action plan for employment, a plan for business development of the municipality
- ▶ Three-year strategic plan of the municipality has been drafted
- ▶ The strategic plan follows the directions listed in the Methodology for strategic planning of the General Secretariat of the Government
- ▶ The strategic documents contain a gender analysis and classification of gender data
- ▶ Extent to which the adopted planning and strategic documents contain all the relevant segments, that is the policy objectives and outcome indicators, activities and costs, competent entities/structures and the deadlines for implementation, as well as instruments for monitoring and assessment.

PRINCIPLE 2:

The municipality has established a monitoring system for the strategies and development plans

1. The indicators of strategies and plans outcomes are measurable and relevant to the objectives.
2. The municipality has established procedures for monitoring the implementation of the strategies and development plans.
3. There exists a competent functional organizational unit for monitoring the strategies and development plans.
4. Reports are produced for the development of certain strategies and plans at least once a year and they are discussed in the municipal council.
5. The reports about the progress of certain strategies and plans are published on the municipal web site.
6. The reports about the progress of some strategies and plans provide accurate and timely information to the mayor and the municipal council.
7. The civil sector and the business sector, are involved in the monitoring of the strategies and development plans, ensuring a possibility for a contribution in the implementation.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the procedures established for monitoring the implementation of the strategies and development plans;
- ▶ Analysis of the strategic and planning documents from the aspect of linking the objectives and the outcomes;
- ▶ Analysis of the reports on the progress of some individual strategies and plans, with the purpose of determining the method of measuring the outcomes and the implementation;
- ▶ Interviews with the employees in the municipality competent for the monitoring of the strategies and the plans;
- ▶ Interviews with the representatives of the civil society organizations and the business-sector for their inclusion into the monitoring of the strategies and the plans for municipal development.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of current planning documents for which a progress report is produced
- ▶ Percentage of progress reports of individual planning documents which are made available to the public at the web-site of the municipality
- ▶ Percentage of the activities realized as compared to those planned in individual planning documents

- ▶ Percentage of realized activities as compared to the planned ones in the program for local economic development
- ▶ Extent to which a system has been established and has proven functional for monitoring the implementation of the strategic and planning documents
- ▶ Complete financial assessment of the strategic and planning documents
- ▶ Extent to which reports provide information for the objectives/results which have been achieved at a centralized location

PRINCIPLE 3:

The decisions of the municipal council are adopted in a coherent manner

1. There exists a functional organizational unit/a person in charge to provide support to the municipal council.
2. The municipal administration has a procedure for a consultation process with all stakeholders prior to the adoption of the decisions by the municipal council.
3. The statute of the municipality defines the decisions and documents which are to be adopted with prior consultations, in line with the procedure established.
4. The Rules of Procedure of the municipal council stipulates certain matters such as participation of the public in the working process, including the right to session attendance by representatives of civil society organizations or citizens themselves.
5. The working program of the municipal council is aimed at achieving the priorities and the objectives defined in the municipal strategic documents and it is made available to the public on the municipal web site.
6. The agenda and the materials for the session of the municipal council are made available to the council members in a timely fashion.
7. The agenda is available to the public prior to the session.
8. Minutes are being produced during the council session and they are being submitted after the session is completed.
9. The decisions of the municipal council, as well as the minutes are available to the public.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Interviews with the employees in the municipality who are in charge of providing support to the municipal council in the process of decision making;
- ▶ Interviews with the municipal council members about the decision-making process;
- ▶ Interviews with the director of the Inspectorate of local self-government;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal Statute;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal council Rules of Procedure;

- ▶ Analysis of the municipal council working program;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal council session agendas;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal council's session minutes;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal web site;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal bulletin.

Indicators

- ▶ Assessment of the published agendas for the municipal council's sessions on the web site
- ▶ Percentage of the municipal council's sessions for which the minutes and the decisions have been published on the municipal web site.

PRINCIPLE 4:

The policies and the strategies are drafted in an inclusive manner, ensuring active participation of the citizens and other stakeholders

1. Procedures for consultations with the citizens, civil society organizations and the business community have been established.
2. Consultations with stakeholders and submission of proposals is conducted within a given time period, with the stakeholders being given sufficient time to discuss the proposed policies and the municipality has sufficient time and resources to analyze the proposals of the consulted parties.
3. The municipality provides a feed-back on whether the opinions proposed by the consulted parties are incorporated and have affected the final decisions of the municipal authorities.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the procedures for consultation with the citizens and assessment of the extent to which the municipalities are applying the procedures;
- ▶ Analysis of the time dynamics and the number of consultation processes compared to the number of policy changes foreseen in the annual municipal plan;
- ▶ Assessment of the extent to which the municipalities publish the consultation outcomes, along with an explanation as to how the outcomes are incorporated in the documents;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations on their inclusion in creating the local policies;

- ▶ Analysis of the reports from external sources about the direct participation of citizens in the municipal decision making so as to determine their influence in the decision making process.
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal web sites so as to ensure whether there exists information on the consultation procedures, the current or past process of consultations, as well as whether the municipality has electronic tools for the consultation process.

Indicators

- ▶ Number of citizens participating in the municipal decision-making in line with the law;
- ▶ The process of consultation with the stakeholders in the preparation of the strategic and planning documents which regulate the local development policies;
- ▶ Average time required for the implementation of the stakeholders consultation process;
- ▶ The municipality has established a consultation procedure for the stakeholders;
- ▶ Extent to which consultations are used in the production of planning documents and decisions.

PRINCIPLE 5:

In the municipal administration there is adequate capacity for the preparation of strategic and planning documents and decisions, as well as for their implementation.

1. The strategic and planning documents are produced by a separate organizational unit for strategic planning.
2. The preparation of policies and strategies is based on the problem and potential impact analysis (costs, benefits and expected effects).
3. The analysis is based on relevant and updated data.
4. Gender aspects are an important segment in the planning of strategies and development policies.
5. The procedures for the implementation of strategic and planning documents, as well as the decisions of the council are established by clear internal procedures of the municipality.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the municipal systematization with the purpose of determining whether an organizational unit for strategic planning has been established;
- ▶ Analysis of the prescribed processes and standards for assessing the policies impact;
- ▶ Analysis the outcomes from the relevant tools for policy development (e.g. impact

assessment or cost-benefit analysis, referring to three fields – development and assessment of the policies, assessment of the certainty and the implementation and evaluation plan) taking two to four public policy fields as an example;

- ▶ Analysis of the training program for the employees;
- ▶ Interviews with employees in the municipality, with the purpose of assessing the process of preparing strategies and plans, as well as the existence of procedures for their implementation;
- ▶ Checking the municipal web sites so as to make sure whether information on documents and plans in the process of preparation is available.

Indicators

- ▶ The municipality has an organizational unit for strategic planning and monitoring of the realization of strategic documents
- ▶ The municipality has established procedures for monitoring the implementation of the strategies and plans for development

PUBLIC SERVICE
AND MANAGEMENT
OF HUMAN
RESOURCES

A decorative horizontal line composed of small white dashes, extending from the left edge of the page towards the right, ending just before the start of the word 'RESOURCES'.

PUBLIC SERVICE AND MANAGEMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES

The conditions for good governance at a local level are the existence of professional, well organized and well trained public administration with a capacity to respond to the citizens' needs within the scope deriving from the local self-government competences.

The municipalities perform their duties through the municipal administration or by establishing local public enterprises and public institutions. Furthermore, they can also delegate certain activities to other legal and natural persons based on the contract for performing activities of public interest, in line with the law.

The local administration as a key pillar in the public service delivery by the municipality is encompassed in the 2015-2020 Program for sustainable development and decentralization by stressing the importance of the activities supporting the transformation of the local administration oriented towards the citizens and the private sector, which is fully prepared to become incorporated in the European administration space.

The local level administration has an equal status as the central level administration and it is regulated by the same law. The key laws regulating the status of the administration in the units of local self-government are the Law on the Public Sector Employees and the Law on Administrative Servants. The administration at a local level entails the administrative servants in the municipalities and the city of Skopje, as well as the public enterprises established by the municipalities and the city of Skopje and those employed in the institutions founded by the municipalities of the city of Skopje. The municipality also employs persons who are not administrative servants (drivers, hygienists, delivery workers etc.). Their work is regulated by the Law on Labor Relations.

Both at central and local level, the existing legal setup requires depoliticisation of the local administration. The need for citizens and business-oriented local administration has been stressed in the strategic documents, primarily in the Strategy on Public Administration Reform. Professionalization is one of the conditions for provision of high quality public services, being ensured by introducing skills and merit-based system, as a criterion for service employment and promotion.

Building a professional administration starts with the selection, that is with the employment in the administration, a process which has to be merit-based exclusively. Job recruitment processes have to be followed by good employee training practices, their assessment, promotion, disciplinary measures and dismissal.

PRINCIPLE 1:

Employment in the municipality, in the public enterprises and institutions established by the municipality is conducted based on transparent criteria, respecting the merit-based and equal treatment principles for all

1. Workplace systematization and organization acts are prepared based on prior functional analysis of the competences and needs of the municipality.
2. Selection and employment in the municipal administration and the institutions founded by the municipality by means of public or internal announcement, shall be merit-based, offering equal opportunities and open competition to everyone.
3. Employment criteria are in line with the needs of the institutions established by the systematizations, job descriptions, as well as the general and specific competences, while the selection process and scouring is regulated by law.
4. Selection and employment committees consist of experts with required experience and expertise for assessing the skills and competences of job applicants.
5. The job applicants who have not been selected are entitled to appeal.
6. Assigning administrative servants and public employees to jobs lower in the hierarchy and termination of work contract is stipulated by law, based on objective criteria.
7. The employees have the right to appeal the assignments lower in the hierarchy, as well as the dismissal.
8. The selection process and employment of office incumbents (directors of public enterprises, schools, institutions, and steering board members) is based on clearly established criteria which are publicly available and open to competition.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the legal framework regarding employment;
- ▶ Analysis of the relevant reports so as to assess the employment practice;
- ▶ Gathering relevant municipal data regarding the employment process;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations regarding the employment processes;
- ▶ Interviews with municipal representatives regarding the employment practice (mayor, municipal secretary, human resources, employees).

Indicators

- ▶ Fluctuation of employees at a local administration level for a period of 2 years
- ▶ Fluctuation of employees at a local administration level for a period of 6 months after the local elections
- ▶ Average number of candidates per announcement for positions at municipal level for the last year
- ▶ Percentage of vacant job positions filled in by public announcement



- ▶ Percentage of female and male employees among the local administration employees
- ▶ Percentage of females and males occupying managerial positions in the municipality in line with the pertinent legal regulation.
- ▶ Percentage of employees at a local administration level by ethnic group
- ▶ Percentage of appeals from the total number of employments in the local administration, as well as the percentage of appeals accepted
- ▶ Percentage of appeals due to termination of work at the level of institutions, as well as the percentage of the appeals accepted
- ▶ There exists an updated job systematization with the description of the required qualifications, which is publicly available
- ▶ Extent to which the selection process and the employment of office incumbents (directors and steering committee members) is based on clearly established criteria which are publicly available and open to competition
- ▶ Extent to which employment of public servants at local level is based on merit-based principle in all its stages

PRINCIPLE 2:

The employee payment system is fair and transparent

1. Classification of the salaries is based on the workplace classification system and ensures coherency, fairness and transparency.
2. Allowances and benefits as an addition to the salary are applied equally to all, based on open and transparent criteria.
3. The discretionary right of the mayor, the council and the office incumbents (directors of public enterprises and institutions) in defining the amount of allowances and benefits is limited with the purpose of ensuring fairness, transparency and consistency in the overall payment system

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the legal framework and the collective contracts regarding the employees' salaries and allowances;
- ▶ Analysis of the national statistics and reports of relevant sources regarding the allowances of public servants;
- ▶ Gathering relevant municipal data related to the allowance system;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations, business community and the academia.

Indicators

- ▶ Number of bonus payments and the total number of bonus payments in the municipality

PRINCIPLE 3:

There exists a system of professional development, fair assessment, mobility and promotion based on objective and transparent criteria.

1. The employees have a possibility for professional development and practical application of the knowledge acquired.
2. Training need assessment is conducted which is related to the employees evaluation system.
3. There exists a program for professional development and constant progress of the employees with a gradual transit towards e-learning.
4. Professional development programs are conducted, monitored and assessed.
5. The programs are accompanied by an adequate budget for professional development.
6. The assessment of the employees' effect is regularly conducted with merit-based criteria.
7. The mobility is based on objective and transparent criteria and it is also applied into practice.
8. Employees' promotion is based on the merit-based principle, as well as on objective and transparent criteria applied into practice.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the relevant legal framework;
- ▶ Analysis of the workplace systematization and organization acts;
- ▶ Analysis of the training program contrary to the workplace systematization;
- ▶ Analysis of the annual reports for the conducted trainings, as well as analysis of other relevant documents or reports;
- ▶ Analysis of the functionality of the e-learning tools;
- ▶ Analysis of the training effects;
- ▶ Analysis of the summary reports from the employee assessment;
- ▶ Gathering relevant municipal data;
- ▶ Interviews with heads of organizational units for human resources management in the municipality about the process of professional development, impact assessment, mobility and promotion;
- ▶ Interviews with ZELS representatives;
- ▶ Interviews with representatives of the Agency of Administration;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations about the process of professional development, impact assessment, mobility and promotion;
- ▶ Analysis of the relevant statistical data.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of municipal administrative servants compared to the total number of citizens in the municipality
- ▶ Percentage of training expenditures of the overall expenditure on annual institutional bases
- ▶ Ratio between the realized and planned trainings for administrative servants in the

- municipality
- ▶ Number of administrative servants who have completed an e-training
 - ▶ Percentage of municipal administration employees and workers in public enterprises founded by the municipality in the assessment levels
 - ▶ Percentage of employees who have been promoted as a result of a public announcement
 - ▶ Percentage of vacant workplaces filled in by promotion
 - ▶ Percentage of jobs filled in by means of mobility
 - ▶ Percentage of employees whose work has been terminated due to subsequent negative results after the performance assessment
 - ▶ Harmonization of the systematization and organization acts with the functional analysis

PRINCIPLE 4:

Measures have been introduced for promoting integrity and prevention of corruption and conflict of interests.

1. The municipality shall adopt integrity policy and it works on establishing an integrity system.
2. The municipality shall prepare a strategy for corruption risks and conflict of interests, as well as an action plan for the strategy implementation (acts and procedures for preventing the corruption risks and conflict of interest with the dynamics of adoption).
3. The municipality shall be ISO standardized and shall have prepared a majority of procedures for preventing the corruption risks.
4. Disciplinary procedures shall be conducted related to corruption and conflict of interests.
5. The right of the employee to appeal to a disciplinary procedure for corruption and conflict of interest shall be prescribed and shall be implemented.


Methodological approach

- ▶ Providing information about the number of employees who have been convicted of a corruption criminal act in the last two years;
- ▶ Surveying the public perception on the integrity and corruption in the municipality;
- ▶ Interviews with the municipality representatives for assessing the application of the legal framework related to the integrity and the disciplinary measures in the public service.

Indicators

- ▶ Number of employees who have been convicted of a corruption criminal act over the last two years compared to the total number of employees
- ▶ Percentage of employees subject to disciplinary or administrative proceedings of the total number of employees
- ▶ Citizens perception on the integrity and corruption in the municipality
- ▶ Extent to which the system of integrity and corruption prevention in public service is being established and applied into practice
- ▶ Extent of implementing the ISO 9001 quality management system

TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY

A decorative white zigzag line consisting of many small, sharp peaks and valleys, extending horizontally from the left edge of the page towards the start of the word 'ACCOUNTABILITY'.

TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY

Transparency and accountability are one of the key preconditions for ensuring good functioning of the local administration, in accordance with citizens' needs and interests. Providing large-scale information both for the work of the municipal bodies, as well as for the services means that the citizens are informed and can thus impact the problem solving processes which are into their interest. They can also participate in the creation and the monitoring of public policies.

Transparency and accountability of the municipality has to be ensured through several channels, that is by electronic and physical means with the purpose of making the information available to various categories of citizens. The information has to be free of charge, predictable, easily accessible and understandable to the public.

The mechanism of free access to public information has to be fully applied by the municipalities, in line with the relevant legal provisions and the public interest.

The municipality has to put efforts for increasing the transparency by implementing the e-tools, thus increasing the effectiveness and the number of information beneficiaries. Open data publishing will increase the potential for using and combining the data which the municipality has published.

The transparency and accountability mechanism has to be followed by a control system and independent monitoring.

PRINCIPLE 1:

The local municipality organization ensures accountability

1. All public enterprises and institutions established by the municipality shall have a defined accountability processes aimed at the municipality by submitting periodic reports.
2. The organization management is improved by issuing authorizations and delegating the decision making by the heads.
3. The reports on the work of public enterprises and institutions established by the municipality are published on the municipal web site and citizens are regularly informed about the finances.
4. The State Audit Office reports are published on the municipal web site.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Identifying the public enterprises and institutions founded by the municipality, as well as identifying their role;
- ▶ Analysis of the public enterprises reports;
- ▶ Analysis of the State Audit Office reports;
- ▶ Interviews with representatives of the municipality, as well as with those working in the public enterprises and institutions founded by the municipality.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of public enterprises and institutions founded by the municipality, which submit regular financial reports to the municipal council
- ▶ Percentage of published reports by public enterprises and institutions at the municipal web site
- ▶ Number of conducted audits by the State Audit Office in the last 4 years
- ▶ Percentage of State Audit Office reports published on the municipal web site in the last 4 years

PRINCIPLE 2:

The right to free access to public information is consistently applied at a local level.

1. The municipality has prepared and published an updated list of public information including all the information related to conducting public duties, in line with the law.
2. The municipality has appointed a person in charge for free access to public information and contact information about the person in charge is easily available.
3. Information is submitted in the required format within a given time period.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the legal framework for free access to public information;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal web site regarding the right to free access of public information;
- ▶ Assessing the selected cases of requests and answers about free access to public information;
- ▶ Analysis of the annual KOMSPI report, as well as other relevant reports;
- ▶ Interviews with servants in charge of ensuring free access of public information;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations about the application of the process of free access to public information by the municipality.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of denied requests for access to public information by the municipality or a public enterprise



- ▶ Number of appeals for the decisions of the municipality and public enterprise to refuse the request for public information
- ▶ Percentage of KOMSPI accepted appeals against the decision of the municipality or the PE to deny the request for access to public information
- ▶ Percentage of requests for public information processed to the Administrative court
- ▶ Extent to which the right to access public information is applied
- ▶ Availability of information pertaining to the right to free access of public information

PRINCIPLE 3:

The municipality shall proactively publish public information on its web site

1. The municipality shall have an official web site in Macedonian language and the languages of the communities represented with over 20 percent.
2. The municipality shall proactively publish public information and data on its web site, in line with its competences.
3. The information and data on the web site shall be easily accessible, understandable to the public and made available in timely fashion.
4. The web site of the municipality shall be accessible to persons with disabilities, in line with the Web Content Accessibility Guidelines - WCAG, published by the Web Accessibility Initiative (WAI) of the W3C Consortium.
5. The municipality shall publish public information in an open data format.
6. The municipality and the municipal institutions shall keep updated databases and registries about records into their competence.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the web site regarding the equivalence of information available in Macedonian language with that in the language of the community represented by more than 20 percent;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal web site for assessing the level of available information in line with the standards for e-transparency in the units of local self-government³
- ▶ Interviews with servants in charge of the municipal web site maintenance;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations about the process of free access to public information by the municipality.

3 Center for Change Management, Center for Sustainable Development – ALKA, Standards for e-Transparency in Local Self-Governments, 2017, http://cup.org.mk/publications/Standardi%20za%20e-transparientnost_MK.pdf

Indicators

- ▶ The municipality has an updated official web site in Macedonian language and the languages of the community represented by more than 20 percent
- ▶ The average application of the indicators about published information on the municipal web site in line with the Standards for e-transparency of the units of local self-government
- ▶ The average application of indicators for the availability of open data of the municipality in line with the requirements in the Standards for e-transparency in the units of local self-government
- ▶ The municipal web site is available to persons with disabilities
- ▶ The web site has a tool for communication/consultation with the citizens

PRINCIPLE 4:

Functional mechanisms for internal audit shall be introduced and the recommendations of the State Audit Office and the Ombudsman for protection of public interest shall be implemented

1. Internal audit shall be established, i.e. an audit of the legality and purposefulness of the municipal and PE activities, which shall be conducted by qualified servants.
2. The municipality and public enterprises shall implement the recommendations of the Ombudsman.
3. The municipality and the public enterprises shall act upon the findings of the State Audit Office.
4. The municipality and the municipal institutions shall act upon the decisions of the Administrative courts.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the legal framework for the local administration internal control and audit;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipality reports by the State Audit Office;
- ▶ Analysis of the reports by the municipal internal auditor;
- ▶ Analysis of the Ombudsman reports;
- ▶ Analysis of the Administrative court reports;
- ▶ Interviews with relevant servants with the purpose of assessing the application of the legal framework;
- ▶ Interviews with the Ombudsman representatives;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society representatives about the effectiveness of the support measures for whistleblowers.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of the SAO recommendations which have been implemented by public institutions at local level for a period of 2 years after being adopted
- ▶ Percentage of Ombudsman recommendations implemented by public institutions at local level for a period of 2 years after they have been adopted
- ▶ Number of complaints to the Ombudsman about the work of the municipality
- ▶ Number of administrative disputes by citizens at the municipal level
- ▶ Number of resolved administrative disputes in favor of the citizens within a given time period
- ▶ Percentage of complaints/administrative disputes resulting in damage compensation.

A decorative horizontal line composed of a series of white slanted dashes, starting from the left edge of the page and ending just before the text.

SERVICE PROVISION

SERVICE PROVISION

Service provision is the mirror of the efficiency, effectiveness and quality of the municipal functioning since then the citizens get in direct contact with the local administration for exercising their right or fulfilling their obligations.

Service provision in its wider sense entails all the contacts (direct and those via other communication channels) of the municipality, public enterprises and institutions founded by the municipality with the citizens and companies processing administrative work.

The municipality has to develop its policies committed to building citizen-oriented administration. Starting with these policies, the municipal services have to be tailored for citizens' needs, i.e. to be provided in line with the citizens' requests.

An effective and efficient service provision approach is of key importance and shall ensure equal treatment. Establishing good services for citizens has to be accompanied by the process of continuous improvement of service quality and ensuring equal service access for all the citizens.

PRINCIPLE 1:

Citizen-oriented service delivery policy shall be applied.

1. The municipal statute and the program documents establish the municipal policy for creating and delivering of public services according to citizens' needs.
2. Mechanisms have been introduced for analyzing the administrative burden and simplification of the administrative services.
3. One-stop-shop services are provided to the clients.
4. Electronic services are provided as an additional channel for client service provision.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the municipal statute and program documents of the local self-government where service provision according to citizens' needs is encompassed;
- ▶ Examining the objectives and the activities in the program documents where the field of service provision according to citizens' needs is defined;
- ▶ Survey on the public perception for the quality of municipal services;
- ▶ Anonymous survey on the quality check of received municipal services;
- ▶ Interviews with administrative servants in charge of client service provision;
- ▶ Interviews with civil sector representatives on assessing the means of citizen service provision.

Indicators

- ▶ The municipality provides ex officio data and documents from other institutions for various administrative services
- ▶ Public perception on the quality of the municipal services
- ▶ Quality of the received municipal services
- ▶ The municipality has an open info office for providing clients service information.

PRINCIPLE 2:

Mechanisms for ensuring local public service quality shall be established.

1. Tools shall be established for providing service quality by the municipality (e.g. Common Assessment Framework – CAF, ISO or other standards for quality management).
2. Service quality shall be monitored and service re-engineering shall be applied in line with the citizens' needs.
3. Citizens shall be informed of the procedures for service delivery by the municipality and public enterprises and institutions founded by the municipality.
4. Administrative servants in charge of service provision shall attend trainings on regular basis.
5. Standards and procedures shall be ensured for providing services by the municipality.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Providing information about tools/standards used by the municipality for quality management;
- ▶ Providing information on whether the municipality has conducted a survey on the public perception about service quality and what the outcomes of the survey are;
- ▶ Providing information on whether the municipality has conducted an anonymous survey and what the outcomes are;
- ▶ Providing information about the use of the survey results by the municipality for service quality assessment, as well as for correcting the process of service delivery;
- ▶ Analysis of the information delivered by the municipality about directing citizens in the service delivery process (instructions about service delivery, forms, administrative fees and taxes);
- ▶ Visit of the service delivery municipal stands for citizens;
- ▶ Gathering data about the trainings of servants who are directly involved in service delivery;
- ▶ Interviews with administrative servants in charge of client service provision;
- ▶ Interviews with civil sector representatives for assessing the process of service delivery to the citizens.

Indicators

- ▶ Number of corrections applied by the municipality in the process of service provision as a result of the surveys about public service quality assessment
- Number of services for which the municipality has provided and published accurate and updated information on directing the citizens in obtaining services in the municipal premises
- Number of services for which the municipality has provided and published accurate and updated information on directing the citizens in obtaining services on the municipal web site
- Percentage of employees who are directly involved in service provision who have attended trainings for improving the service quality
- The municipality uses tools and techniques for quality assurance (e.g. Common Assessment Framework – CAF, ISO and other standards for quality management).

PRINCIPLE 3:

Public services provided by the municipality are accessible to various categories of citizens.

1. Service delivery location provides equal access to services for persons with disabilities.
2. E-services are provided as an additional channel for service provision to citizens.
3. Services (including e-services) are adapted for vulnerable groups, e.g. persons with disabilities, socially marginalized persons, elderly etc.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Visiting the service delivery locations where services are offered by the municipality;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal web site and/or other web sites which provide municipal e-services;
- ▶ Analysis of the e-services provided by the local self-government;
- ▶ Interviews with administrative servants and civil sector about the accessibility of public services.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of the municipal services which are e-delivered
- ▶ Percentage of e-services which are web accessible for persons with disabilities

- ▶ Percentage of provided e-services as compared to the standard services (service delivery locations in the municipality)
- ▶ The municipality is physically accessible to persons with disabilities
- ▶ The municipality has appointed a person for supporting persons with disabilities and the elderly for obtaining a service.
- ▶ The municipality offers benefits to persons with disabilities, the socially marginalized, the elderly etc.

MANAGEMENT OF MUNICIPAL FINANCES



MANAGEMENT OF MUNICIPAL FINANCES

The municipal financial framework is defined in the municipal budget. Therefore, the municipal budget represents a declaration of the values and priorities. Budgeting and financial planning techniques are key elements in the maintaining of fiscal integrity. It is of great importance because of the need for maintaining trust of the citizens into someone spending their money.

Budget drafting has to be conducted in line with the defined budget process. Citizens' participation in the budget drafting means a better-quality budget process, by defining the priorities which are important to the citizens.

On the other hand, transparency in budget spending plays an important role in improving the good perception about municipal good governance. Budget execution has to be accompanied by regular financial reports, so as to ensure monitoring of expenditures, as well as to provide grounds for better budget planning in the future.

Public procurements are a key segment in budget expenditures when it comes to potential misuse and corruption. Public procurements have to be aligned with the principles of transparency, nondiscrimination and equal treatment.

The municipality has to possess incorporated mechanisms for good finance management and control, so as to ensure high quality planning, execution and audit of the budget execution.

PRINCIPLE 1:

Budget planning and drafting is conducted in line with the defined budgetary process according to the relevant legal framework, involving the citizens, as well.

1. The municipality shall draft the budget based on a three-year strategic planning of projects and activities, the assets needed for their realization, sources of financing and defining competent organization units for the realization.
2. Budget circular shall be drafted by the municipality within a defined deadline, by reporting on the basic macroeconomic indicators, main directions for drafting the municipal budget, appropriations for the municipality allocated from the national budget, or funds budgets, as well as on incomes from other sources.
3. The municipality shall implement realistic budgeting, that is system of financial planning which is based on reality, analytic approach, established options which citizens are informed about, as well as on comprehensive data about expenditures and incomes.
4. Citizens shall be involved in the budget drafting process, ensuring sufficient time for analysis and interventions, which are incorporated in the draft-budget through public consultations.
5. The municipal council shall have sufficient time for analyses of the draft budget.
6. The municipality shall conduct mid-term budget planning which defines priorities and plans for priorities implementation within a longer time period.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the municipality strategic plan;
- ▶ Analysis of the budget circular by the municipality in the last two years;
- ▶ Analysis of the draft budget by the municipality in the last two years;
- ▶ Analysis of the adopted budgets by the municipality for the last two years;
- ▶ Analysis of the municipal reports on the inclusion of citizens in the budget drafting process;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations about the municipal budget drafting process;
- ▶ Analysis of the latest mid-term financial plans of the municipality.

Indicators

- ▶ Number of days within which the citizens can have an insight and discuss about the draft-budget
- ▶ Number of days within which the council can discuss the draft-budget
- ▶ Percentage difference between the planned budget revenues and the realized budget revenues in the year with the latest available data
- ▶ Percentage difference between the planned budget expenditures and the realized budget expenditures of the year with the latest available data
- ▶ Percentage of public debt compared against the municipal budget
- ▶ Percentage of budget revenues deriving from own revenue sources

- ▶ Percentage of budget revenues from dedicated block appropriations
- ▶ Percentage of revenues in the budget deriving from capital block appropriations
- ▶ Percentage of budget assets allocated for salaries as compared to the overall budget
- ▶ Percentage of assets for development projects in the municipality compared to the overall budget
- ▶ Percentage of expenditures by sector/activity reflecting the municipal priorities (education, infrastructure, local economic development, culture etc.)
- ▶ Percentage of budget assets for supporting and cooperating with the civil sector
- ▶ Extent to which the municipality prepares the budget based on three-year planning
- ▶ Extent to which the municipality follows the defined budget process

PRINCIPLE 2:

Budget execution is transparent and followed by appropriate audit

1. The municipal budget beneficiaries shall submit monthly reports to the mayor about the budget execution.
2. The mayor shall submit to the Ministry of Finance and the municipal council quarterly reports, which are made available by the municipality, with an explanation about the budget execution no later than one month after the quarter expires.
3. Citizens' budget shall be adopted and published, which provides a simplified overview of the municipal revenues and expenditures.
4. After the end of the fiscal year, the municipal council shall adopt and publish annual municipal budget account, which contains all the elements found in the municipal budget listed as planned and realized revenues and expenditures for all budget beneficiaries.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Gathering relevant municipal information;
- ▶ Analysis of the SAO of other audit reports;
- ▶ Analysis of the produced quarterly financial reports for the last year;
- ▶ Analysis of the latest municipal budget annual balance sheet.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of submitted quarterly financial reports by the municipality to the Ministry of Finance and the municipal council
- ▶ Percentage of published quarterly financial reports by the municipality in the last year
- ▶ The municipality has drafted and published a citizens budget
- ▶ The municipality conducts mid-term budget planning
- ▶ Extent to which the balance sheet is published

- ▶ Extent to which quarterly financial reports contain the necessary information in line with the law and their availability
- ▶ Extent to which the annual financial report is submitted on time to the municipal council and the Ministry of Finance

PRINCIPLE 3:

Municipal public procurements shall follow the principle of transparency, nondiscrimination and equal treatment

1. The municipality shall produce an annual plan about public procurements, which it afterwards shall publish.
2. The municipality shall publish a list of major suppliers.
3. Upon planning the public procurement, market research shall be conducted with the purpose of improving the bidding documents.
4. The bidding documents shall contain clear, impartial technical specifications, with requirements which are proportionate to the contract subject matter.
5. Public procurements shall be implemented based on effective competition, as well as on timely and efficient procedures.
6. The municipality shall monitor the execution of the contract.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the annual plans for public procurement for the last two years;
- ▶ Gathering information from the municipality about:
 - number of conducted public procurements by type over the last year,
 - number of received offers on conducted public procurements,
 - concluded contracts on public procurement in the last year;
- ▶ Analysis of a sample of 5 public procurements in the municipality in the last two years with the aim of assessing the process of public procurement implementation;
- ▶ Interviews with civil society organizations on the method of implementing the municipal public procurements;
- ▶ Interviews with representatives of the business community on the method of conducting public procurements in the municipality.

Indicators

- ▶ Percentage of contracts that have been announced in the plans for public procurements
- ▶ Percentage of contracts awarded by bidding procedure
- ▶ Percentage of contracts awarded by negotiation without public announcement
- ▶ Percentage of contracts with changed value by an annex after the contract award
- ▶ Average number of offers submitted for procurements with a public announcement
- ▶ Percentage of e-public procurements
- ▶ Percentage of public procurements with e-auction

- ▶ Existence of educated personnel with adequate qualification for public procurement in the municipality
- ▶ The municipality has a system for monitoring and reporting on public procurements

PRINCIPLE 4:

The municipality and municipal public enterprises and institutions shall have sufficient capacity and resources for good management of finances.

1. The municipality shall establish internal procedures for financial governance and they are followed.
2. There shall be a capacity and resources in the finance department in the municipality.
3. The municipality shall establish a functional organizational unit/a person in charge for internal audit.
4. The municipality shall adopt annual internal audit plans.
5. Corrective measures shall be applied based on the report from the internal audit.
6. The municipality shall establish a functional organizational unit/ a person in charge of public procurement.

Methodological approach

- ▶ Analysis of the municipal systematization regarding the organizational units competent for financial management;
- ▶ Gathering relevant municipal data;
- ▶ Analysis of the internal audit for the last two years;
- ▶ Gathering information from the municipality about applied corrective measures based on the internal audit reports for the last two years.

Indicators

- ▶ Number of employees in the organizational units competent for the municipal financial management
- ▶ Number of employees in the organizational unit for public procurement
- ▶ Number of employees in the organizational unit for internal audit
- ▶ Percentage of employees in the organizational units in charge of financial management, compared to the overall number of employees in the municipality
- ▶ Extent of established effective audit in the municipality

METHODOLOGICAL ANNEX

OF THE STANDARDS FOR GOOD GOVERNANCE IN THE UNITS OF LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT



1. Development and coordination of policies and strategies

Quantitative indicators

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
1	Percentage of adopted current strategic and planning documents of the municipality	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of adopted strategic and planning documents by the overall number of documents to be adopted, and the result is multiplied by 100.	<p>The number of planning documents which the municipality shall adopt is obtained by analyzing the legislation. In general, the following documents shall be adopted: a strategic plan of the municipality, a strategy for local economic development, a strategy for culture development, a strategy for social protection of citizens, a strategy for cooperation with associations and foundations, a strategy for promotion of gender equality, youth strategy, a program for healthcare, child and social protection, a program for energy efficiency, environment protection program, utility program, urban planning program, general urban planning scheme, sports and recreation program, culture activities program, a program for celebrating significant events and prominent persons with monuments, a local action plan for employment, municipal business development plan.</p> <p>Information on the strategies adopted for the current period can be obtained on the web site of the municipality or by request for access to public information.</p>
2	Percentage of current planning documents with progress reports being produced	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of adopted planning documents via progress reports by the overall number of adopted	
3	Percentage of reports on the progress of individual planning documents published on the municipal web-site	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of published reports on the progress of planning documents on the web site by the overall number of reports, and it is multiplied by 100.	<p>By analyzing the adopted planning documents and progress reports for the current period. The adopted planning documents and progress reports can be obtained on the municipal web site or by request for access to public information.</p>

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
4	Percentage of realized activities as compared to planned activities in the individual planning documents	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of realized activities from the planning documents by the overall number of planned activities on a sample of 3 current planning documents, multiplied by 100.	By analyzing the adopted planning documents and progress reports for the current period. The adopted planning documents and progress reports can be obtained on the municipal web site or by request for access to public information.
5	Percentage of realized activities as compared to the planned activities from the program for local economic development	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of realized activities from the local economic development program by the overall number of planned activities, and it is multiplied by 100.	By analyzing the program for local economic development and the latest report for realization (if applicable).
6	Percentage of published session agendas of the municipal council on the web site	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of published agendas on the municipal web site by the overall number of council sessions, and multiplied by 100.	The published agendas are searched on the municipal web site. The overall number of sessions for the analysed period is obtained based on the requests for public information.
7	Percentage of council sessions for which minutes and decisions pertaining to the period of the last year are published.	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of municipal council sessions for which the minutes and decisions are published by the overall number of municipal council sessions, and it is multiplied by 100.	
8	Number of realized forms of citizens participation in the municipal decision-making in line with the law	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of proposed citizens initiatives - Number of realized citizens meetings upon the request of the municipal electorate - Number of realized municipal referenda - Number of complaints and proposals by the citizens or a group of citizens - Number of organized public discussion platforms, surveys and requested proposals by the citizens in drafting the municipal regulations - Number of organized petitions 	Number of citizens' participations in the decision making for every form is obtained by requests for access to public information.
9	Percentage of conducted consultations with stakeholders in producing the strategic and planning documents identifying the local development policies	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of strategic and planning documents which have been subject to consultation by the overall number of adopted planning and strategic documents, multiplied by 100.	By analyzing the adopted planning documents for the analysed period. The adopted planning documents and information about consultations can be obtained on the web site or by a request for access to public information.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
10	Average time period for conducting consultations with stakeholders	<p>One of the following answers is selected for this indicator:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No consultations with stakeholders are conducted - Up to 1 week - Up to 1 month - From 1 to 3 months - More than 3 months 	<p>By analyzing information about the consultations with stakeholders for the analysed period. Information can be obtained by interviewing relevant persons, analyzing the municipal web site or the requests for access to public information.</p>
11	Drafted municipal three-year strategic plan for the municipality	Yes /No	<p>From the municipal web site or the requests for access to public information. The strategic plan should be for the current year.</p>
12	The strategic plan of the municipality follows the directions determined by the Methodology for Strategic Planning of the General Secretariat of the Government	<p>Assessment according to the level of alignment with the directions provided by the Methodology for Strategic Planning of the General Secretariat of the Government</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 0. Not followed at all. 1. Partially followed. 2. Followed to great extent. 3. Fully aligned with the Methodology directions.
13	The strategic documents contain gender analysis and categorized gender data	Yes / No	<p>By analyzing 3 randomly selected adopted strategic documents for the current period. The adopted strategic documents can be obtained on the web site or by a request for access to public information.</p>
14	Extent to which the adopted strategic and planning documents contain relevant segments, that is the policy objectives and outcome indicators, costs and activities, entities/structures in charge and deadlines for implementation, as well as instruments for monitoring and assessment.	<p>Assessment of the extent to which the adopted strategic and planning documents contain relevant segments, that is the policy objectives and outcome indicators, costs and activities, entities/structures in charge and deadlines for implementation, as well as instruments for monitoring and assessment.</p>	<p>Assessment of randomly selected 3 adopted strategic and planning documents for the current period</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 0. Does not contain the required elements. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Contains certain elements. 2. Contains most of the elements, but not all of them. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3. All listed elements are contained.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
15	Extent of established functioning system for monitoring the realization of strategic and planning documents	Assessment of the extent of established functioning system for monitoring the realization of strategic and planning documents	<p>Information can be obtained by interviewing relevant persons, analyzing the municipal web site or a request for access to public information.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 0. There is no monitoring and reporting system. 1. Reporting is a part of the general reporting of the municipality without the success indicators. 2. There exists a dedicated system for monitoring and reporting and it is being regularly used, but there are no success indicators. 3. The monitoring system has ad hoc indicators, but it does not have basic/starting value and the indicators are not linked to the planning document objectives 4. There exist some indicators, but they are process-oriented (results, not effects). The permanent indicators are not regularly measured and they are partially used for monitoring and assessment of the realized objectives. 5. There exists a developed system of monitoring and reporting, both for the results and the activity effects. They are linked to the objectives of the planned documents. Data is gathered in regular intervals and it is analysed for making decisions.
16	Complete financial assessment in the strategic and planning documents	Assessing the completeness of the financial assessment in the strategic and planning documents	<p>Information can be obtained through the analysis of the strategic and planning documents.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 0. There is no financial assessments in the planning documents. 1. A majority of the planning documents do not contain financial assessment for the implementation of the measures. 2. Most of the planning documents contain a financial assessment, yet only for the additional costs necessary for the implementation of the measures. 3. Most of the planning documents contain financial assessment on the additional costs, but they have no information on the sources of financing. 4. A majority of the planning documents contains full financial assessment, while the donor sources of financing are defined separately. 5. All planning documents have full financial assessments, along with the source of financing.
17	Extent to which the reporting provides information about the achieved objectives/results	The municipality has to report adequately about the planning documents achieved objectives.	<p>Assessment is conducted about 3 randomly selected planning documents by analyzing the planned activities against the realized ones.</p> <p>Information has to be either publically available on the municipal web site, or to be requested as public information.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 0: report on the achieved objectives from the planning documents does not exist. 1: there is a formal reporting, but without clear presentation of the achieved objectives. 2: there is a reporting with clear presentation of the achieved objectives.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
18	Extent to which analytic tools are used for creating planning documents and decisions	Assessment in line with procedure described in the following column.	<p>Information can be obtained by interviews with relevant persons, analysis of the municipal web site or by a request for access to public information.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 0. There is no systematic use of analytic tools. 1. Occasionally, exclusively consultations are used. 2. Consultations exclusively are used regularly. 3. Ex-ante analysis is conducted occasionally, however: it is low quality and not comprehensive, including only fiscal/financial implications 4. Ex-ante analysis is regularly conducted, yet only fiscal/financial implications are well analysed. 5. High-quality thorough ex-ante analysis is conducted
19	Extent of using consultations in creating planning documents and decisions	Assessing the extent of using consultations with stakeholders in creating planning documents and decisions	<p>Information can be obtained by interviewing relevant persons, analyzing the web site or by requesting access to public information.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 0. No consultations are conducted. 1. Occasional or ad hoc consultations are conducted without any procedure establishing a clear consultation process. 2. There exist rules for conducting the consultation process, yet they are occasionally applied. 3. There exist rules for conducting the consultation process, they are regularly applied, yet there are no mechanisms for monitoring the realization and the results. 4. There exist rules for conducting the consultation process, they are regularly applied, and there is a mechanism for monitoring the realization and the results. 5. There exist rules for conducting the consultation process, they are applied on regular bases and there is a mechanism for monitoring the realization and the results. The consultation outcomes are publicly available.
20	Level of public availability of planning documents and decisions at a centralized location	Assessing the level of availability of planning documents and decisions at a centralized location	<p>Information can be obtained by analyzing the municipal web site.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 0. Planning documents are not publicly available. 1. Planning documents are publicly available at a centralized location – the municipal web site. 2. Planning documents and decisions are publicly available at a centralized location – the municipal web site. 3. Planning documents, reports and decisions are publicly available at a centralized location – the municipal web site.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
21	The municipality has an organizational unit for strategic planning and monitoring of the realization of strategic documents	Assessing the fact whether the municipality has a functional organizational unit or strategic planning and monitoring of the realization of strategic documents	By analyzing the systematization act and the organizational chart of the municipality. O. No. 1. Yes, but there is no employed personnel. 2. Yes and there is employed personnel.
22	The municipality has established a procedure for monitoring the implementation of the strategies and the development plans	Assessing whether the municipality has established a procedure for monitoring the implementation of the strategy and the development plans and whether it is applied	The municipal procedures can be obtained on the municipal web site of by a request for access to public information. O. No.
23	The municipality has established a consultation procedure with stakeholders	Assessing whether the municipality has established a consultation procedure with stakeholders and whether it is being applied.	1. Yes, but they are not applied. 2. Yes, and they are regularly applied. O. No.

2. Public service and human resources management

Quantitative indicators

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
1	Fluctuation of employees at the level of local administration for a period of two years	Positive indicator means positive fluctuation (the number of newly employed is higher than the number of those who have left), while negative indicator means negative fluctuation (the number of newly employed is lower than the number of those who have left).	<p>Analysis for the defined period is conducted through the information available in the employee registry in the public sector for a given period, or by submitting a request to the municipality for public information.</p> <p>The indicator is obtained by deducting the number of servants who have left (due to contract termination or mobility) from the number of new employees (employment and mobility transfers) for the analysed period for the municipal administration and the employees in the public enterprises founded by the municipality.</p>
2	Fluctuation of employees at the local administration level for a period of 6 months after the local elections	A positive indicator means positive fluctuation (number of new employees is higher than the number of persons who have left), while a negative indicator means a negative fluctuation (number of new employees is lower than the number of those who have left).	<p>The analysis is conducted for the defined period based on the information available in the registry of public sector employees for a given time period or by submitting a request to the municipality for public information.</p> <p>The indicator is obtained by deducting the number of servants who have left (due to contract termination or mobility) from the number of new employees (employment and mobility transfer) for the analysed period in the municipal administration and the employees in public enterprises founded by the municipality.</p>
3	Average number of candidates for public announcement in the last year on municipality level	The indicator is obtained by dividing the sum of candidates for all public announcements at the municipality level for a given time period by the overall number of announced job positions.	Analysis is conducted based on the information obtained from the Agency for Administration.
4	Percentage of vacant jobs filled in by public announcement	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of vacant job positions filled in by public announcement by the overall number of vacant job positions filled in by any means for a given time period, multiplied by 100.	Analysis is conducted based on the information obtained by submitting a request for public information to the municipality and public enterprises founded by the municipality.

Good governance standards in the units of local self-government

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
5	Percentage of women and men at the level of local administration employees.	The indicator is obtained by separately defining the percentage of women and men employed as compared to the overall number of employees.	The information is obtained from the report on public sector employees for a given time period, or by requesting access to public information in the municipality and the public enterprises founded by the municipality.
6	Percentage of women and men at high managerial positions in the municipality in line with the relevant legal regulation.	The indicator is obtained by defining the number of employed women from the overall number of employees at managerial positions in the municipality (head of unit, assistant head of department, head of department and secretary general).	The information is obtained from the report for public sector employees for a given time period or by requesting access to public information in the municipality.
7	Percentage of employees at the local administration level by ethnic group	The indicator is obtained by defining the number of ethnic minority employees as compared to the overall number of employees in the municipality and municipality-founded PEs. The following ethnicities are taken into consideration: - Macedonians - Albanians - Turks - Roma - Vlachs - Serbs - Bosniacs - Others	Information is obtained from the reports about employees in public sector for a given time period, or by requesting access to public information in the municipality and the public enterprises founded by the municipality.
8	Percentage of complaints filed taking into consideration the overall number of employment procedures at the level of local municipality and percentage of accepted complaints	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of complaints in employment procedures by the overall number of procedures in the municipality for the last year. The number of accepted complaints is additionally presented.	Information is obtained by a request for access to public information in the municipality or a second instance body.
9	Percentage of complaints due to the termination of work contract at the level of institutions and percentage of accepted complaints	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of complaints in termination procedures by the overall number of procedures in the municipality for the last year. The number of accepted complaints for the last year is additionally presented.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality and the second instance body.
10	Number of money awards and the total value of money awards in the municipality	The calculation refers to the last two years. The number of money awards and the total value of the award in the municipality is established.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality and public enterprises founded by the municipality.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
11	Percentage of administrative servants in the municipal administration as compared of residents in the municipality	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of administrative servants by the total number of residents in the municipality at a given moment.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality about the number of administrative servants and residents, as well as information from the State Statistics Office for the average number of population in the municipality.
12	Percentage of expenditures for training of the total annual expenditures at the level of institution	The indicator is obtained by dividing the training expenditures by the total expenditures, and the result is multiplied by 100. The indicator is calculated for the municipality and the PEs founded by the municipality.	Information is obtained by analyzing the budget and the balance sheet for the last year.
13	Ratio between the realized and planned trainings for administrative servants in the municipality	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of realized trainings by the number of planned trainings for the last year.	The information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality.
14	Number of administrative servants who have completed an e-training	Number of administrative servants who have completed an e-training in the last year.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality.
15	Percentage of employees in the municipal administration and employees in the public enterprises founded by the municipality in the assessment levels	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of employees in the assessment levels by the overall number of employees and it is then multiplied by 100. Employees level of assessment is as follows: 1. A – value 4,51 to 5 2. B – value 3,51 to 4,50 3. C – value 2,51 to 3,50 4. D – value 1,51 to 2,50 5. E – value 1,00 to 1,50	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality and analysis of the LAS and LPSE, as well as the systematization act of the municipality.
16	Percentage of employees who have been promoted on the bases of a public announcement	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of promotions via public announcement by the overall number of employees for the last two years, and it is multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality.
17	Percentage of vacant job positions which have been filled in by promotion	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of vacant job positions filled in by promotion (internal announcement) by the overall number of vacancies filled in anyhow in the last two years, and it is then multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality.
18	Percentage of employments filled in via mobility	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of vacant job positions filled in via mobility by the overall number of vacancies filled in anyhow for the last two years, and it is then multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality.



	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
19	Percentage of employees whose contract has been terminated due to subsequent negative outcome of performance assessment	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of employees with termination due to negative assessment by the total number of employees for the last two years, and it is multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality.
20	Number of employees who have been convicted of criminal acts related to corruption in the last 2 years compared to the total number of employees	The indicator represents an absolute value of the number of employees who have been convicted of criminal act related to corruption in the last 2 years compared to the total number of employees	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality or the competent court.
21	Percentage of employees subject to disciplinary or administrative proceedings compared to the total number of employees	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of employees subject to disciplinary or administrative proceedings by the total number of employees in the last two years, multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality or the administrative court.
22	There exists an updated available systematization of work places with a description of required qualifications	Assessing whether the systematization act is applied in line with the LAS and LPSE, that is whether it is updated and made available	It is checked by analyzing the web site of the municipality or by requesting access to public information. 0. There is no updated systematization act. 1. The act is updated, i.e. after new laws are applied, yet it is not available on the web site. 2. The act is updated and it is available on the municipal web site.
23	Extent to which the process of selection and employment of office incumbents (directors of SC) is based on clearly established criteria which is available and open to competition	Criteria to be fulfilled: - Defined process with clearly defined criteria - Transparency of the process - Open competition in applying and selection	The assessment is based on the analysis of the internal procedures in the municipality and by interviews with responsible persons. 0. A defined process does not exist. 1. One of the criteria is met. 2. Two of the criteria are met. 3. All three criteria are met.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
24	Extent to which local level administrative servants employment is based on the merit principle in all its stages	<p>It is described in LAS and LPSE. The following are the elements to be included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Open and equal opportunities - Defined criteria - The selection process is defined - Selection is conducted by competent committees - Right to appeal 	<p>The assessment is based on the analysis of the internal procedures in the municipality, thus analyzing 2 random procedures, as well as on the interviews with persons in charge.</p> <p>0: The elements are not applied. 1: One element is applied. 2: Two elements are applied. 3: Three elements are applied. 4: Four elements are applied. 5: All the elements are applied</p>
25	Alignment of the systematization and organization acts with the functional analysis	Assessing whether the systematization and organization acts are aligned with the implemented functional analysis	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality or interviewing the persons in charge.
26	Citizens perception on integrity and corruption in the municipality	The indicator pertains to establishing the perception of citizens on integrity and corruption in the municipality.	<p>Perception is assessed by analysis/research conducted in the municipality or by interviews/focus groups with the NGO, private sector and citizens' representatives.</p> <p>0. Citizens' perception is that there is no integrity in the work and that corruption is present. 1. Opinions among citizens are divided. 2. Citizens' perception is that corruption level is low and work integrity is at satisfactory level. 3. There prevails a perception that corruption is absent and work integrity is at a high level.</p>
27	Extent to which the system of integrity and prevention of corruption in public service is applied	Integrity and corruption prevention system entails the strategy for corruption risks and conflict of interests, as well as an action plan with defined acts, procedures and disciplinary measures	<p>Assessing the extent by analyzing the municipal internal procedures and interviewing responsible persons.</p> <p>0. There is no integrity and corruption prevention system. 1. The system is not applied. 2. The system is partially applied. 3. The system is fully applied.</p>

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
28	Extent of implementation of ISO 9001 quality management system	ISO 9001 is a standard for quality management and it has to be applied by the municipality, including the procedures for preventing the risk of corruption.	<p>Implementation is assessed by analyzing the internal municipal procedures and interviewing responsible persons.</p> <p>0. No system for quality management has been introduced.</p> <p>1. System is introduced, but it does not entail procedures for preventing the corruption risk.</p> <p>2. A system which covers the entire municipality operations is introduced.</p> <p>3. The system is introduced and certified by an accredited certifying body.</p>

3. Transparency and accountability

Quantitative indicators

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
1	Percentage of public enterprises and institutions founded by the municipality, which submit regular financial reports to the municipal council	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of PEs and institutions which have submitted reports for the last year to the council by the overall number of PEs and institutions, multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information and analysis of the municipal web site.
2	Percentage of published reports by public enterprises and institutions on the municipal web site	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of published reports submitted to the municipal council by PEs and institutions by the total number of received reports by PEs and institutions, multiplied by 100	By submitting a written request for access to public information, the municipality and public enterprises founded by the municipality are contacted for obtaining: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of received requests for access to public information; - The number of processed positive requests for access to public information; - The number of unprocessed requests for access to public information for the period entailed by the survey.
3	Percentage of requests for access to information that have not been processed by the municipality or a public enterprise	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of unprocessed requests by the total number of submitted requests for access to public information for the last year, multiplied by 100.	By submitting written request for access to public information, the municipality and public enterprises founded by the municipality are contacted for obtaining: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of received requests for access to public information; - The number of processed positive requests for access to public information; - Number of processed negative requests for access to public information.
4	Percentage of denied requests for access to public information by the municipality and public enterprises	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of denied requests by the overall number of requests submitted for access to public information for the last year, multiplied by 100.	By submitting written request for access to public information, the municipality and public enterprises founded by the municipality are contacted for obtaining: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The number of received requests for access to public information; - The number of processed positive requests for access to public information; - Number of processed negative requests for access to public information.

Good governance standards in the units of local self-government

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
5	Number of lodged complaints against the decision of the municipality or the public enterprise for rejecting the request for access to public information	The indicator represents the absolute value of the number of submitted complaints against the decision of the municipality or public enterprises to reject the request for access to public information	By analyzing information in the annual report for the work of the KOMSPI or by submitting a request to KOMSPI for access to public information.
6	Percentage of accepted complaints by KOMSPI against the decision of the municipality and public enterprises to reject the access to public information	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of accepted complaints by the overall number of lodged complaints about the requests for access to public information, and it is then multiplied by 100.	
7	Percentage of requests for public information forwarded to the Administrative court	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of complaints forwarded to the Administrative court by the overall number of rejected complaints by KOMSPI about the request for access to public information for the last year, and it is then multiplied by 100.	By analyzing the information published by KOMSPI or the Administrative court, or by submitting a request for access to public information to KOMSPI or the Administrative court.
8	The average fulfillment of indicators for the information published on the web site of the municipality in line with the requirements from the Standards for e-transparency in the units of local self-government	This indicator is obtained by dividing the sum of the indicators assessment from the standards for e-transparency by the overall number of indicators.	Information is obtained by analyzing the web site of the municipality per indicator defined in the standards for e-transparency in the ULSG. Every single indicator is separately assessed: - No (there is no published information); - Partially (information is partially published); - Yes (information is published).
9	The average fulfillment of indicators for published open data of the municipality in line with the requirements of the standards for e-transparency in the units of local self-government	This indicator is obtained by dividing the sum of separate assessments per indicator from the standards for e-transparency by the overall number of indicators.	Information is obtained by analyzing the web site of the municipality, as well as by analyzing the central portal on open data managed by the MISA as to the extent of open data being published.
10	Number of conducted audits by the State Audit Office in the last four years	The indicator represents the absolute value of the conducted audits by the SAO in the last four years	Information is derived from the web site and the reports of the State Audit Office. The web site of the municipality is being checked for the availability of published reports of the State Audit Office pertaining to the municipality.
11	Percentage of published reports by the State Audit Office on the web site of the municipality for the last 4 years	This indicator is obtained by dividing the number of SAO published municipal reports on the web site by the overall number of published municipal reports, then multiplied by 100.	

- 1 Center for Change Management, Center for Sustainable Development – ALKA, Standards for e-transparency in the units of local self-government, 2017, http://cup.org.mk/publications/Standard%20za%20e-transparenciost_MK.pdf

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
12	Percentage of recommendations by the SAO which are implemented by the public institutions at local level for a period of 2 years after the adoption.	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of individual SAO recommendations in the year subject to analysis which have been implemented by public institutions at local level in the next two years by the overall number of recommendations, and then multiplied by 100. Practical implementation of the recommendations is being analysed instead of analyzing the internal regulation.	By analyzing the SAO reports for the given period; By requesting access to public information in the municipalities or public institutions at local level for the implementation of the recommendations; By interviewing relevant persons in the municipalities and public institutions at local level.
13	Percentage of recommendations by the Ombudsman which have been implemented by the public institutions at local level within 2 years after the adoption	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of the Ombudsman individual recommendations for the analysed year which have been implemented by public institutions at local level in the next two years by the overall number of recommendations, and it is then multiplied by 100. The implementation is analysed into practice, not only declaratively into the internal regulation.	By analyzing the Ombudsman reports for the given time period; By requesting access to public information from the municipality or public institutions at local level related to the implementation of the recommendations; By interviewing relevant persons in the municipality or public institutions at local level.
14	Number of complaints to the Ombudsman for the work of the municipality	The indicator represents the absolute value of the number of complaints to the Ombudsman for the work of the municipality in the last two years.	By submitting requests for access to public information to the Ombudsman.
15	Number of administrative disputes initiated by citizens at municipal level	The indicator represents an absolute value of the number of administrative disputes initiated by citizens at municipal level for the last two years.	By analyzing the annual reports of the Administrative court or intentional request for access to public information from the Administrative court.
16	Number of resolved administrative disputes on behalf of the citizens	The indicator represents absolute value of the number of resolved administrative disputes on behalf of the citizens in the last two years.	By analyzing annual reports of the Administrative court or by intentional request for access to public information from the Administrative court about municipal disputes for the last 2 years.
17	Percentage of complaints/administrative disputes resulting in damage compensation	The indicator is obtained by dividing the overall number of complaints resulting into damage compensation by the overall number of complaints, and it is multiplied by 100.	By analyzing annual reports of the Administrative court or by intentional request for access to public information from the Administrative court about municipal disputes for the last 2 years.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
18	The web site contains a tool for communication/consultation with the citizens	Assessing whether the municipality has established tools for communication/consultation with citizens and the extent of its application	By analyzing the municipal web site and by interviewing people and non-governmental sector. O. No. 1. Yes, but it is not effectively. 2. Yes, and it is effectively used.
19	Extent of practical application of the right to access public information	The following elements have to be represented: 1) Legal acts and by-laws are published on the municipal web site; 2) The municipality issues statements for the public about the activities undertaken in line with the legal obligations; 3) The municipality publishes statistical data on their work; 4) The municipality publishes reports about their activities, as well as reports submitted by other public institutions that fall under the municipal competence; 5) The municipality makes public information available by some other means.	Information on the elements is obtained by analyzing the municipal web site, interviewing municipal and public institutions representatives at local level, analysis of 3 to 5 request samples for access to public information. 0: None of the elements is included. 1: One of the elements is encompassed. 2: Two elements are encompassed. 3: Three elements are encompassed. 4: Four elements are encompassed. 5: All the elements are encompassed.
20	Extent of published information about the right to access public information	The following elements should be encompassed: 1. Name and surname of person in charge; 2. Phone number of the person in charge; 3. Address; 4. E-mail for submitting requests; 5. Procedure for access request; 6. Deadline for receiving an answer; 7. Possibility for monitoring the request status.	Information about elements is obtained by analyzing the municipal web site. 0: None of the elements is encompassed. 1: Only element 1 and 2. 2: Elements 1 to 4. 3: Elements 1 to 4 and one of the remaining elements. 4: All the elements are encompassed.

INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
<p>21</p> <p>The municipality has an updated official web site in Macedonian language and the languages of the minorities represented by over %20.</p>	<p>Checking whether the municipality has an updated official web site in Macedonian language and the languages of the minorities represented by over %20.</p>	<p>By analyzing the municipal web site, information about the elements is obtained by analyzing the municipal web site. The web site is considered to be updated if there is news referring to the last months, as well as available current documents and accurate contact information.</p> <p>0: The municipality does not have an official web site.</p> <p>1: The municipality has a web site in only one language, but it is not updated.</p> <p>2: The municipality has a web site in only one language and it is being updated.</p> <p>3: The municipality has an official web site both in Macedonian and in the languages of the minorities represented by more than %20 and it is being updated.</p>
<p>22</p> <p>The web site of the municipality is accessible to persons with disability</p>	<p>Web accessibility means that the web site is developed in a way that can be used by persons with disabilities using assistive technology devices.</p>	<p>The municipal web site testing from the aspect of meeting the requirements from the web content accessibility guidelines WCAG. The assessment is obtained by entering the web site address at http://wave.webaim.org/. The number of errors from the test is confirmed.</p>

4. Service provision

Quantitative indicators

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
1	Number of corrections which the municipality has conducted in the process of service provision as a result of survey for quality measurement of public services	Number of procedures or processes which have been amended for a period of 2 years	Information is obtained by interviews with persons in charge.
2	Number of services for which the municipality has provided and published accurate and updated information about citizens' directions in the service provision procedures in the municipal premises.	What is the number of services for which the following information has been published: - Service instructions, forms; - Administrative fees and allowances; - Competent department/unit, contact.	Information is obtained by surveying field information in the municipality.
3	Number of services for which the municipality has provided and published accurate information about directions for citizens to obtain services on the municipal web site.	What is the number of services for which the following information has been published: - Service instructions, forms; - Administrative fees and allowances; - Competent department/unit, contact.	Information is obtained by analyzing the web site of the municipality.
4	Percentage of employees directly involved in service provision, who have attended trainings for improving the service quality.	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of employees who have attended a training for improving service quality by the overall number of employees in service provision, multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by requesting public information.
5	Percentage of municipal e-services	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of e-services by the overall number of services, multiplied by 100.	Information is obtained by surveying the municipal competences, the citizens log book and the web site of the municipality.
6	Percentage of e-services which are web accessible to persons with disabilities	The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of e-services accessible to persons with disability by the overall number of e-services, and it is multiplied by 100.	Testing the municipal e-services from the aspect of meeting the requirements of the web content accessibility guidelines WCAG. The assessment is obtained by entering the e-service address at http://wave.webaim.org/ . The number of test-proven errors is also entered.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
7	Percentage of provided e-services as compared to the standard services (at the municipal stands)	<p>The indicator is obtained by dividing the number of realized e-services by the overall number of realized services, and then multiplied by 100.</p> <p>The number of realized services means the number of procedures for citizens requests.</p>	<p>Information is obtained by requesting access to public information.</p>
8	The municipality provides data and documents from other institutions ex officio for the needs of the administrative services.	<p>The indicator pertains to whether the municipality provides information and documents from other institutions ex officio for offering one-stop-shop services.</p>	<p>Information is obtained by field surveys and/or by requesting access to public information.</p> <p>0. No data and documents are provided from other institutions ex officio.</p> <p>1. Data and documents from other institutions are provided ex officio for certain services only.</p> <p>2. Data and documents from other institutions are provided ex officio for all the services when needed.</p>
9	Public perception on the quality of municipal services.	<p>Elements of high quality service:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Service provision premises interior; - Accessibility to the service provision premises; - The relations of the employees towards the clients during the service provision; - Citizens awareness about the service provision process; - Waiting time at the service delivery locations. 	<p>Information is obtained by surveying citizens and organizations of focus groups with representatives of the business sector, civil society organizations and citizens with regards to the quality of at least 3 public services.</p>
10	Quality of municipal service provision	<p>The info office is a location where municipal services are provided and where citizens can get informed about the procedures of service provision.</p>	<p>Information is obtained by conducting an anonymous survey – mystery shopper.</p>
11	The municipality has an open info office for providing information to service users	<p>Some of the tools/standards:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - CAF; - ISO 9001 for quality management; - EFQM; - Other standards. 	<p>Information is obtained by field survey in the municipal premises and/or by requesting access to public information.</p>
12	Local self-government uses tools and techniques for service provision (e.g. Common Assessment Framework, ISO and many other standards for quality management)		<p>Information is obtained by requesting access to public information or by interviewing persons in charge in the municipality.</p> <p>0. No.</p> <p>1. Partially.</p> <p>2. Yes.</p> <p>3. Yes and improvements are applied.</p>



	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
13	The municipality is physically accessible to persons with disability	Access of persons with disability to the municipal building and the premises for service provision	<p>Information is obtained by visiting the municipality and field inspection.</p> <p>O. No.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Partially – only the municipality main entrance. 2. Partially – only certain premises. 3. Full accessibility – the municipal building and the service provision premises.
14	The municipality has appointed a person for assisting persons with disability and the elderly in service provision.	Assessing whether the municipality has appointed a persons to assist persons with disabilities and the elderly in service provision.	<p>Information is obtained by visiting the municipal premises and field inspection, as well as by interviewing the municipal representatives or requesting access to public information.</p> <p>O. No.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Yes, but the information about that person is not published in the premises or the web site. 2. Yes, information about that person is published in the premises and the web site.
15	The municipality provides benefits to persons with disabilities, the socially marginalized, the elderly, etc.	<p>Type of benefits:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lump sum assistance, volunteering service; - Meal; - Clubs; - Residence 	<p>Information is obtained by paying visits to the municipality and by field inspections, as well as by requesting access to public information.</p> <p>O. No.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Partially. 2. Yes.

5. Management of municipal finances

Quantitative indicators

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
1	Number of days within which citizens may have an insight and give comments about the draft-budget	Number of days within which citizens may have insight and give comments about the draft-budget for the last year	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information in the municipality, as well as by interviewing representatives of the civil sector and the municipality.
2	Number of days within which the council can discuss the draft budget	Number of days within which the council can discuss the draft budget for the last year	Information is obtained by requiring access to public information in the municipality, as well as by interviewing representatives of the council and the municipality.
3	Percentage difference between the planned budget revenues and the realized budget revenues for the last available year	This indicator is obtained by calculating the difference between the foreseen annual revenues for the approved budget for previous year with the realized revenues by the end of the previous year, in line with the last available data.	By analyzing the municipal budget and the annual financial statement for that same year. Analysis is conducted for the last year for which there is an available annual financial statement.
4	Percentage difference between the planned budget expenditures and the realized budget expenditures for the last available year	This indicator is obtained by comparing the foreseen annual expenditures for the approved budget with the realized expenditures by the end of the previous year, in line with the latest available data.	By analyzing the municipal budget and the annual financial statement for the given year. The analysis is conducted for the last year which an annual financial statement is available for.
5	Percentage of public debt as compared to the municipal budget	This indicator is obtained by dividing the amount of the public debt by the municipal budget for the last year.	The amount of the public debt is obtained from the Ministry of Finance via a request for access to public information. The amount of the municipal budget is obtained by analyzing the published budget or by requesting access to public information.
6	Percentage of budget revenues from own revenue sources	This indicator is obtained by dividing the assets from own revenue sources by the overall budget.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the municipal budget.
7	Percentage of budget revenues from block appropriations	This indicator is obtained by dividing the assets from block appropriations by the overall budget.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the municipal budget.
8	Percentage of budget revenues from capital block appropriations	This indicator is obtained by dividing the assets from capital block appropriations by the overall budget.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the municipal budget.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
9	Percentage of budget assets allocated for salaries compared to the overall budget	This indicator is obtained by dividing the salaries assets by the overall budget.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the municipal budget.
10	Percentage of assets for municipal development projects compared to the overall budget	This indicator is obtained by dividing the assets for development projects by the overall budget.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the municipal budget.
11	Percentage of expenditures per sector/activity reflecting the municipal priorities (education, infrastructure, local economic development, culture etc.)	This indicator is obtained by dividing the realized expenditures in municipal priority sectors by the overall realized expenditures.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the annual financial statement of the municipality for the analysed period.
12	Percentage of assets in the budget for support and cooperation with the civil sector	This indicator is obtained by dividing the assets for support and cooperation with the civil sector by the overall expenditures.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the municipal budget.
14	Percentage of submitted quarterly financial reports by the municipality to the Ministry of Finance and the municipal council.	This indicator is obtained by dividing the overall number of submitted quarterly reports by the municipality to the council and the MF by the overall number of expected reports in the last year.	The indicator is obtained by requesting access to public information and interviewing the persons in charge in the municipality, the council and the MF. The overall number of expected reports is 4 reports per year for the analysed period.
15	Percentage of published quarterly financial reports by the municipality for the last year	This indicator is obtained by dividing the overall number of municipality published quarterly reports by the overall number of reports.	The indicator is obtained by analyzing the municipal web site.
16	Percentage of contracts which have been announced in the published public procurement plans	The assessment of this indicator is based on the public procurements which are a part of the announced public procurement plan, divided by the overall number of public procurement for the given year, expressed in percentages.	Information about the public procurement plan is obtained by analyzing the municipal web site or other contracting bodies at local level, or by requesting access to public information. The number of published procurements is retrieved from the EPPS.
17	Percentage of contracts awarded by competition procedure	The assessment of this indicator is based on public procurements conducted by using the EPPS in the last two years, and the number of completed procedures with contract signed is divided by the overall number of procurement contracts expressed in percentages.	Information about the signed contracts after the competition procedure is obtained from the EPPS. The overall number of procurement contracts is obtained by requesting access to public information from the municipality of another contracting body at local level.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
18	Percentage of contracts awarded by negotiation procedure, without publishing an open announcement	Assessing this indicator is achieved by dividing the number of completed procedures without a public announcement by the overall number of procurement contracts in the last two years expressed in percentages.	Information about signed contracts by negotiation procedure, without a public announcement, is obtained by requesting access to public information from the municipality or any other competent body at local level.
19	Percentage of contracts with changed value due to a signed annex after the awarding procedure is complete	Assessing this indicator is based on the public procurement contracts, and it is obtained by dividing the number of annex contracts of any type by the overall number of procurement contracts in the last two years expressed in percentages.	Information about annex contracts and the overall number of contracts is obtained by requesting access to public information from the municipality or another contracting body at local level.
20	Average number of offers submitted for a procurement with public announcement	This indicator is assessed by the mean value of the offers submitted for public procurement for the last year.	Information is obtained by requesting access to public information from the municipality.
21	Percentage of public e-procurements	This indicator is assessed based on the means for submitting the offer and the number of obligatory e-offers for procurements for the last year, is divided by the overall number of procurements, expressed in percentages.	Information about the number of offers is obtained from the EPPS.
22	Percentage of public procurements by e-auction	This indicator is assessed based on the realized procurement, and the number of obligatory e-auction procurements is divided by the overall number of procurement for the last year, expressed in percentages.	Information about the number of offers can be found at EPPS.
23	Number of employees in the organizational unit competent for managing the municipal finances	Obtaining the number of employees in the organizational units competent for managing the municipal finances	
24	Number of employees in the organizational unit for public procurement	Obtaining the number of employees in the organizational unit for public procurement	
25	Number of employees in the organizational unit for internal audit	Obtaining the number of employees in the organizational unit for internal audit	
26	Percentage of employees in the organizational units competent for financial management as compared to the overall number of employees in the municipality	Assessing this indicator is conducted by dividing the number of employees in the unit for financial management by the overall number of employees in the municipality	Information is obtained by analyzing the systematization act of the municipality and the organization chart, as well as by requesting access to public information from the municipality.

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
27	Extent of preparing the budget by the municipality based on three-year planning	Assessing the extent of the municipality preparing the budget based on three-year planning	<p>It is assessed by conducting interviews with persons in charge in the municipality and by analyzing the planning and strategic documents of the municipality, taking into consideration the scope of the planned financial resources in the strategic and planning documents, as well as their representation in the budget.</p> <p>0. No. 1. Partially 2. Yes</p>
28	Extent to which the municipality is following the defined budget process	Assessing the extent to which the municipality is following the defined budget in accordance with the law.	<p>Assessment is conducted based on the interviews with persons in charge in the municipality and the Ministry of Finance and by analyzing the legal requirements for budget process at local level.</p> <p>0. No. 1. Partially. 2. Yes.</p>
29	The municipality has produced and published citizens budget	Determining whether the municipality has produced and published citizens' budget, which demonstrates in a simplified manner the budget itself and budget expenditures by the municipality.	<p>It is assessed by analyzing the municipal web site and analyzing the document itself related to the approved budget.</p> <p>0. No. 1. Partially. 2. Yes.</p>
30	The municipality is conducting mid-term budget planning	Assessment of the extent to which the municipality is conducting mid-term budget planning	<p>Assessment is conducted based on the interviews with persons in charge in the municipality, as well as based on the analysis of the legal requirements for mid-term budget planning.</p> <p>0. No. 1. Partially. 2. Yes.</p>

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
31	Extent of publishing the annual financial statement of the municipality	<p>The following elements have to be met:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Annual balance sheet of the budget contains the planned and realized revenues and expenditures; 2. The balance sheet entails all the budget beneficiaries; 3. The balance sheet is produced in timely fashion; 4. The balance sheet is published in timely fashion. 	<p>Every element is 1 point worth. Information about elements is obtained by analyzing the legal framework, the web sites of the public institutions at local level, interviews with representatives from the municipality and the public institutions, analysis of the quarterly reports for the last year which a balance sheet is provided for.</p> <p>O: None of the elements is included. 1: 1 point. 2: 2 points. 3: 3 points. 4: 4 points.</p>
32	Extent of the quarterly financial reports containing the necessary information and being available in accordance with the law	<p>The following elements have to be met:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Quarterly reports are prepared in timely fashion; 2. Quarterly reports are all-inclusive and in line with the legal requirements; 3. Quarterly reports are published in timely fashion; 4. Quarterly reports are publicly available; 5. Quarterly reports are consistent with the annual financial reports. 	<p>Every element is 1 point worth. Information about the elements is obtained by analyzing the legal framework, the web site of the public institutions at local level, interviews with the representatives of the municipality and public institutions at local level, analysis of the quarterly reports on the last year balance sheet is provided for.</p> <p>O: None of the elements is included. 1: 1 point. 2: 2 points. 3: 3 points. 4: 4 points. 5: 5 points.</p>
33	Extent of submitting the annual financial statement in timely fashion to the council and the Ministry of Finance	<p>The following elements have to be included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The elements shall reflect the structure of the budget; 2. They shall contain the legally defined information; 3. The statement shall be approved by the municipal council within a 6 month period after the expiry of the year; it pertains to; 4. It has been subject to audit by an independent body (SAO); 5. A discussion session of the municipal council has been conducted for the annual financial statement. 	<p>Every element is 1 point worth. Information about the elements is obtained by analyzing the legal framework, the web site of the public institutions at local level, interviews with municipal representatives, analysis of the financial statement for the last year for which a balance sheet has been approved.</p> <p>O: None of the elements is included. 1: 1 point. 2: 2 points. 3: 3 points. 4: 4 points. 5: 5 points.</p>

	INDICATOR	DEFINITION	PROCEDURE
34	Qualifications and education of the municipal personnel related to public procurements	Assessing the extent to which the municipal personnel is qualified and educated for public procurements	<p>The assessment is defined based on the information acquired from the municipality.</p> <p>0: There is no dedicated body/person in the systematization in charge of PP;</p> <p>1: The systematization PP positions are filled with less than %50;</p> <p>2: The systematization PP positions are filled with over %80;</p> <p>%80-50 :3 of employees for PP have completed a training and have the required qualifications for PP;</p> <p>4: Over %80 employees for PP have completed a training and have the required qualification for PP;</p> <p>5: The systematization for PP is filled in with qualified and trained personnel.</p>
35	The municipality has a system for monitoring and reporting on public procurement	<p>A comprehensive system for monitoring and reporting on public procurement shall ensure:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Planning and preparation (publishing a plan for PP and a dialogue); 2. Monitoring and negotiating (announcements, decisions about awarding of PP, applied procedures, number of offers); 3. Contract monitoring (contracts, annexes, results); 4. A system of gathering and processing of PP data; 5. Reporting after the PP is completed; 6. Functionalities for providing information required for external analysis; 7. Data analysis to the level of an economic operator, a product/service or a contract; 8. Public access to information. 	<p>Information about elements is obtained by requesting access to public information from the municipality or by interviewing competent servants in the municipality.</p> <p>0: There is no system of monitoring and reporting on public procurements.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1: The system contains only the obligatory reports. 2: The system entails 4 elements. 3: The system entails 5 elements. 4: The system entails 6 elements. 5: The system entails 7 elements, the eight element is obligatory.
36	Extent to which the municipality has established an effective internal audit	<p>Elements to be included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A defined organizational unit/person in the systematization responsible for internal audit; 2. Qualified servants for internal audit; 3. Established process for conducting internal audit; 4. Regular internal audits; 5. Implementing the recommendations from the internal audit by the management in the municipality. 	<p>Information about the elements is acquired by requesting access to public information from the municipality and/or by interviewing competent persons in the municipality.</p> <p>0: None of the elements is included.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1: Only 1 element is included. 2: Element 1 and 2 are included. 3: Element 1 to 3 is included. 4: Element 1 to 4 is included. 5: All the elements are included.



  **EU**
for
YOU! 